Project Viability Report Pollok Stables

Old Stable Courtyard, Pollok Country Park





The Architectural Heritage Fund





The report has been prepared by Glasgow Building Preservation Trust, thanks to generous support from Heritage Lottery Fund (Resilient Heritage Grant), Architectural Heritage Fund (Project Viability Grant) and Glasgow City Council.

Version	Date	Author	Approved	Revisions
1.1	26.03.2018	A. McConnell	A. McChlery	First GBPT Draft
1.2	29.03.2018	A. McConnell	A. McChlery	Incorporating team comments
1.3	18.09.2018	A. McConnell	A. McChlery	Incorporating GCC comments
1.4	18.02.2019	A. McConnell	A. McChlery	GCC approved for release

		Contents	
ΕX	ECU	TIVE SUMMARY	4
1.	INT	RODUCTION AND BACKGROUND	5
1	.1	HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE	5
1	.2	CONDITION SUMMARY AND RISK STATUS	5
1	.3	OUR INVOLVEMENT	6
1	.4	ACTIVITIES TO DATE	7
1	.5	OWNERSHIP ISSUES	8
2.	CO	NDITION OF BUILDING	9
3.	SIT	UATION AND PLANNING CONTEXT	10
3	5.1	DESIGNATIONS	10
3	.2	STAKEHOLDERS	10
3	.3	OTHER CONSIDERATIONS	10
3	.4	ACCESS	11
3	5.5	FLOODING	12
3	6.6	SENSITIVITIES	12
3	5.7	USE	12
4.	OP	TIONS FOR USE	13
4	.1	SUMMARY OF PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT	13
4	.2	SUMMARY OF CONSERVATION NARRATIVE	14
4	.3	SUMMARY OF BUSINESS CASE	16
4	.4	SUMMARY OF GOVERNANCE OPTIONS	17
4	.5	RECOMMENDED OPTION	19
4	.6	COSTS	20
4	.7	FUNDING	21
4	.8	URGENCY AND THE 'DO NOTHING' RESPONSE	22
5.	CO	NCLUSION	23
6.	AC	ΓΙΟΝ PLAN	24
7.	APF	PENDICES	26

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This feasibility summary report draws together the reports on activities in the second half of 2017 which sought to identify a future for Pollok Stables – a category A listed complex of buildings in a courtyard arrangement situated close to Pollok House within Pollok Country Park.

Informed by the 2016 Options Appraisal, the project team led by Glasgow Building Preservation Trust undertook a public engagement programme, considered the heritage significance of the buildings, developed an outline business case and considered potential governance options. This involved discussion with stakeholders, park users and potential tenants and it collected feedback which is relevant to the management of the wider park.

Without doubt, there is significant support for the repair and redevelopment of these historic buildings as a mixed use attraction which capitalises on the assets of Pollok Country Park. The recently constituted Friends of Pollok Country Park group have expressed a particular eagerness to see these buildings saved and remain keen to be involved.

The archaeological, historical and architectural importance of Pollok Stables cannot be overstated and much is yet to be learned about the early development of the site. This offers an excellent opportunity to develop an archaeology programme to further engage the public and to better inform the development of the project.

Whilst the overall strategy is of preservation, the condition of the internals allows sufficient alteration and flexibility to accommodate a mix of uses, whilst still preserving the character of the unique complex of buildings.

The design team has illustrated how a mix of uses might be accommodated and these have estimated construction cost of £6.5m. Combined with other project costs and contingencies, it is likely that total project costs of at least £8.5m should be anticipated. External funding will be required to realise this cost, but as owners, there will be an expectation upon Glasgow City Council to contribute a significant proportion of these costs.

The nature and mix of indicative uses will evolve as the project develops, but the most important aspect of this study has been to recommend a governance strategy. Clearly, the management and maintenance of the complex has failed and a new arrangement is required.

The buildings would remain under the ownership of Glasgow City Council, but a long term lease to a large established charity could enable a heritage focused charity to manage the buildings and sub-let to a variety of tenants to realise the potential of this fascinating site. Our recommendation is that Glasgow City Council considers an organisation such as the National Trust for Scotland as lessee to take on full responsibility for Pollok Stables. In NTS there is an established track record and experience in managing and maintaining historic buildings, as well as a historic relationship with Pollok Estate. However, more detailed discussions will be required under indicative approval of both parties to develop this proposal further.

With the condition of Pollok Stables deteriorating, it should be with some urgency that Glasgow City Council consider this report and proceed as recommended. The trajectory of the default 'do-nothing' approach will result in the loss of these important buildings.

1. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1.1 HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

Pollok Stables is a category A listed courtyard stable complex with ancillary buildings, including a B-listed Sawmill. The complex is associated spatially and historically with A-listed Pollok House and the B-listed Walled Garden.

The Old Stable Courtyard is located within Pollok Country Park to the south east of Pollok House, on the north bank of the White Cart Water. It comprises a square courtyard of buff, stone-built, one and two-storey buildings predominately dating from the 18th century when the new stable complex was first constructed on the site of the medieval Laighe Castle (low castle) and then underwent significant changes and additions in the 19th century.

There remains, incorporated within the outer wall of the Stables' east range, a section of wall from this medieval castle as well as a significant amount of recycled 17th century fabric within the buildings, including a fine renaissance arch which serves as the main entrance to the Stables courtyard.

Unlike the rigid classical geometry of Pollok House, the Stables buildings exhibit a vernacular style having evolved over a number of periods rather than being subject to a single stage of design and construction. This is undoubtedly part of their unique character.

1.2 CONDITION SUMMARY AND RISK STATUS

Whilst the courtyard range of buildings have only officially been on the Buildings at Risk Register since 2007, the south west range of the courtyard has been vacant and propped up with timber buttressing since the mid-eighties. The condition of the buildings has deteriorated gradually over the last thirty years and this deterioration has accelerated in the last three years.

Concerned about recent movement to the south west corner of the courtyard range, Glasgow City Council closed off the riverside carriageway for public safety reasons in 2016. GCC sought to develop proposals to undertake urgent consolidation works whilst also approaching Glasgow Building Preservation Trust about developing a longer term vision for the complex.

In 2017, further areas of the courtyard range were vacated as Glasgow City Council assessed that the buildings had deteriorated further. The south and west ranges were completely vacated and the western pend was closed off. The final tenant was relocated in December 2017 and the horses were removed in early 2018. The former visitor centre has been repurposed as an office for the remaining livestock and garden staff.

The buildings remain in very poor condition and with the lack of passive supervision as a result of the remaining tenant vacating, the buildings are particularly vulnerable.

It is understood that Glasgow City Council are seeking to effect emergency repairs to consolidate the south and west ranges of the complex, but even this has been delayed. The rapidly deteriorating condition of the building requires that the Owner must take action now if there is to be any hope of saving the complex.

1.3 OUR INVOLVEMENT

Glasgow Building Preservation Trust is an independent charity which exists to rescue, repair and restore historic buildings at risk and return them to use in their communities.

Glasgow Building Preservation Trust was approached by Glasgow City Council in 2016 to identify a long term vision for repair and redevelopment of the complex. This study involved a detailed structural condition survey including test pits and CCTV drainage surveys to establish the condition of the Stables complex and make recommendations for its repair. This study also considered a long list of potential options and associated uses for the Stables complex, ranging from a baseline 'repair only' approach to a series of mixed use commercial and public access proposals.

The preferred option was a mixed use solution which encourages a high volume of public access and engagement, carefully balanced with a number of income generating uses such as a café, shop, accommodation to let and some commercial units. A full cost report scheduled construction costs for the main Stables courtyard range, the three adjacent buildings and associated additional development costs.

The 2016 study had a limited focus - to establish baseline condition and cost information to make an informed recommendation for a preferred option - and therefore it was suggested that to further develop the preferred option, a more detailed Feasibility Study with associated business case development and engagement with stakeholders and community groups is undertaken.

GBPT was re-engaged in 2017 to undertake the community consultation and develop and outline business and governance strategy for the proposals. This report is based on the findings and considerations of these activities.

As a Building Preservation Trust, GBPT would be well placed to develop and deliver the redevelopment of Pollok Stables, provided an end-user could be identified.

As an independent charity, GBPT is well regarded by funders in the heritage sector for its ability to develop projects that rescue, repair, share and celebrate the heritage of our built environment in a manner that benefits communities, increases volunteering and brings people together as they learn new skills. As a known entity, funders in the sector have confidence in GBPT's ability to deliver heritage projects.

As a charitable property developer, GBPT uses its experience to deliver the capital works in a professional client capacity before selling the completed property or assigning a long lease to the charitable end-user.

This report is prepared without prejudice to Glasgow City Council's consideration of any future involvement of Glasgow Building Preservation Trust.

1.4 ACTIVITIES TO DATE

This report summarises the activities of three workstreams:

- Community consultation and engagement
- Outline business case and governance study
- Design development

Community Engagement and Consultation

Led by Northlight Heritage, the community engagement was undertaken between August and December 2017 and involved three themed events: to explore the history and heritage of the site (Pollok's Past); to understand the current condition and issues (Unstable Present); and to explore options for future uses (Stable Future). These themed events were undertaken twice each – with a midweek and weekend session. Alongside the public events, there was an on-line questionnaire survey and one-to-one discussions held with heritage academics with local expertise and attendance at community group meetings. In addition, there was a summary session held in December, within Pollok House, to share the findings and recommendations of the consultation events.

The community engagement report can be found in the appendices.

Outline business case and governance study

Led by Community Enterprise, the business and governance study looked at the potential revenue generating uses and indicators of expected income streams alongside a study of the governance options around: the retained ownership of Glasgow City Council; the proximity of Pollok House and the Burrell Collection; the management and maintenance needs of the building complex. The outline business case undertook some market research and studied similar projects as examples of alternative strategies for the governance and management.

The Outline Business Model Appraisal and Research Report are summarised in this report.

Design Development

The design development was led by Collective Architecture with support from: conservation accredited architect Fiona Sinclair; Cost Consultants Gardiner and Theobold and; Structural Engineers David Narro Associates.

The design proposals further developed the previous designs, recognising the further deterioration of the condition of the buildings and establishing a hierarchy of areas of heritage sensitivity. The emerging proposals assumed that there was no requirement for additional newbuild floorspace and that all proposed uses could be accommodated within the current footprint.

The Design Report is included within the appendices.

The Conservation Narrative, Structural Engineer's report and the Cost Consultants report are not available for public release.

1.5 OWNERSHIP ISSUES

The Pollok Estate had been the seat of the Maxwell Family for over 800 years. In 1939, Sir John Maxwell, owner of the Pollok Estate, made the first pioneering Conservation Agreement with the National Trust for Scotland, covering part of the parkland. Almost 30 years later the Maxwell family gifted Pollok House and 361 acres of surrounding land to the City of Glasgow. Today GCC manage the Country Park, utilising the Stables complex as their main operational base, with the exception of Pollok House which is managed by the NTS. The NTS has an influence over the management of Pollok Estate through the Conservation Agreement (which includes the Stables complex) and the work of the Pollok Advisory Committee.

The 1939 Conservation Agreement is not available as part of this public release.

In addition, Glasgow Life (also owned by Glasgow City Council), operate the Burrell Collection, which is undergoing a £66m redevelopment project. The Burrell Renaissance will affect the use of Pollok Country Park as it seeks to increase the number of visitors to the park, provide additional catering options within the completed building and provide a base for Countryside Rangers Staff.

The land and buildings of Pollok Country Park are owned by Glasgow City Council, as gifted by the Maxwell family, for the benefit of the citizens of Glasgow. It is therefore unlikely that Glasgow City Council could ever sell the buildings or Pollok Country Park to another party. Consideration of how the retained ownership of Glasgow City Council can be mitigated in terms of management of the complex and levering external funding as inevitably required is discussed further under 'Options for Use'.

The legal restrictions and conditions on use and the subsequent management of the leases on the former Estate have been problematic for Glasgow City Council, where a number of stakeholders have emerged as a result of their historic leases giving them greater rights than originally intended. Control and management of uses within Pollok Country Park appears to have become quite disparate, with seemingly an increase in the number of organisations operating from within the former estate, but also a perceived decrease in the maintenance of the Park in recent years. Pollok Country Park was named the Britain's Best Park in 2007 and then Best Park in Europe in 2008.

Feedback received during the public engagement process has highlighted public concern about the general state of the park, the number of vehicles in the park, the condition of the numerous buildings in the park and the lack of cohesive management. The introduction of additional stakeholders has the potential to further complicate the situation and will require to be carefully managed.

2. CONDITION OF BUILDING

The south and west ranges of the courtyard complex are at risk and have been listed on the Buildings At Risk Register since 2007. Unoccupied and in poor condition, the timber floor and roof structures having suffered from extensive decay and settlement as a result of flooding over numerous years. The movement of the walls to the south and west ranges is a particular concern, which the owners are now seeking to consolidate.

The closure of the riverside carriageway in 2016 and then the closure of the pend in 2017 have highlighted the perilous state of the buildings. As of March 2018, it is understood that Glasgow City Council will look to have the courtyard buildings vacated entirely, due to their concerns about the ongoing deterioration of the south and west ranges and the potential risk to public safety.

It is as a matter of urgency that Glasgow City Council should confirm emergency consolidation works. It is desirable that full a record of the building (including laser scanning) should be undertaken prior to any works or downtakings.

Current inactivity by Glasgow City Council to arrest the deterioration of these buildings will not give external funders confidence required to invest significant sums in a future project. If Glasgow City Council cannot undertake consolidation works to a building they own and manage, it is unlikely that an external funder would step-in to assist.

The north and west ranges are in better condition, though the combination of a lack of effective maintenance to the roofs and the buildings recently being made vacant are a cause for concern. Whilst the eviction of the pigeons from the rooms north of the pend on the West range are a positive development, the departure of the last remaining tenant removes the passive supervision that the complex has benefitted from to date.

3. SITUATION AND PLANNING CONTEXT

3.1 DESIGNATIONS

Pollok Country Park has numerous statutory designations upon it which are relevant to the Stables complex:

- Pollok Country Park is a Conservation Area, with Article 4 directions
- Site of Special Landscape Importance -
- Site of Importance for Nature Conservation -
- Subject to Conservation Agreement with National Trust for Scotland
- Category A and B listed buildings

Despite these designations to protect the landscape and built heritage of the former estate, the condition of many of the buildings within the park has deteriorated and the general condition of the Park has declined. Statutory protections can become meaningless if they are not understood, effected, utilised or enforced.

3.2 STAKEHOLDERS

In addition, further consideration of major stakeholders should include:

- Management of Pollok House by National Trust for Scotland NTS have expressed a desire to strengthen their presence in what could be seen as their spiritual home (NTS was founded in Pollok House). NTS should be considered as an existing organisation with the capacity and ability to take responsibility for the completed Pollok Stables.
- The Burrell Renaissance Project by Glasgow Life GL are delivering a project that could see a significant increase in the number of visitors to Pollok Country Park. GL have indicated a desire for: reduction in vehicles within the country park; better management and governance of the county park, strengthening the marketing of the Country Park as a destination with potentially three major attractions (Burrell Collection, Pollok House and a completed Pollok Stables).

Whilst Pollok House and the Burrell Collection have very different offerings, the ancillary facilities such as café and toilets will be in competition. There is recognition that Pollok House has seen an increase in use of their café and toilets since the Burrell closed and it is also noted that a significant number of visitors to the Burrell Collection utilised the toilets and café.

3.3 OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Other use related considerations include:

- Employees of GCC Land and Environmental Services, based at Pollok Stables. Pollok Country Park is one of only two GCC parks that has a specific workforce. Whilst it is GCC's intention to relocate the Countryside Rangers to the Burrell Collection building, there remains a staff workforce that is dedicated to the management of the livestock and walled gardens.
- Other stakeholders within Pollok Country Park (Police Scotland, Cricket Club, Golf Club etc). Some of these longstanding lessees will be significantly affected by the increase in use of Pollok Country Park and consideration should be given to their rights of access, as well as their obligations.
- Amenity / Informal user groups: Friends of Pollok Country Park, ParkRun etc. The public consultation process has raised awareness of the developments

within Pollok Country Park and highlighted the need for a balance of uses which provide both public access and income generation.

3.4 ACCESS

Pollok Country Park is easily accessible from the City Centre by public transport and by cycling, yet many visitors currently drive into the Country Park where provision of car parking is insufficient. The issue isn't the accessibility of the periphery of the park, but the size of the park, with most car drivers preferring to park either at the Pollok House car parks or the Burrell Collection, which are located between 0.5 and 1 mile from the entrances to the park. Public engagement supports the following objectives:

- 1. Reduce number of vehicles entering Pollok Country Park
- 2. Restrict vehicle access in front of Pollok House
- 3. Promote and increase use of public transport
- 4. Promote and increase use of cycling (where compatible with pedestrian walkways).

It is understood that the Burrell Renaissance Project is developing proposals to mitigate the impact of seeking to attract a large increase in visitors. Consideration is being given to peripheral car parking and provision of a land-train within the park. It is understood that the detail around this is contained within a masterplan document being prepared by Glasgow Life.

This could be supplemented with banks of bicycles for affordable hire at every car park. Pollokshaws West Station is the nearest rail station and it hosts a cycle hire social enterprise, which could support the maintenance of a Pollok Country Park cycle hire program.

It is also understood that the Burrell Collection should be accessed from Nether Pollok, with service vehicles entering from Pollokshaws Road only. The road between the Burrell and Pollok House would be restricted. There are legitimate concerns that this would essentially cleft the park in two, with Pollok House therefore only accessible from the Haggs Castle / Lochinch entrance.

Consideration should be given to improving the current temporary arrangement of providing service access to Pollok Stables through the Police Scotland compound as part of the vehicular management strategy, which will require that Stables complex is serviced and it would be preferable for that service access to not pass the front of Pollok House.

A significant proportion of existing users of the Park are from the local area. In particular, most users reside on the east side of the M77 motorway which acts as a boundary and barrier to the park.

With the Transformational Regeneration Area of Pollokshaws there will be further investment in new housing immediately adjacent to the Pollokshaws Road entrance, which will be satisfied with pedestrian access only.

With limited access to the park from the west, further consideration of how to improve accessibility for the communities in G51, G52 and G53 postcode areas is required.

3.5 FLOODING

The proximity of the White Cart has long been an issue at Pollok Stables. Flood prevention measures upstream of Pollok Country Park have been effective at reducing flooding in residential areas by heightening flood barriers (which moves the problem downstream) and reducing the flow of the river through flood retention measures (in lieu of flood plains). However, flooding still occurs and is a particular issue for GCC Parks staff as their operational compound is particularly vulnerable to flooding at very short notice.

Periodic flooding of the site combined with ineffective drainage has resulted in soils being washed away which has in-turn caused structural damage to the south and west ranges. Key requirements include:

- 1. Future-proofing the structure, by underpinning the existing foundations to mitigate future flood damage.
- 2. Provision of demountable and temporary flood barrier system to prevent water ingress and to divert flood waters (a sensitively designed equivalent of sand-bagging), where early warning of significant flood events are given.
- 3. Specification of finishes that mitigate impact of flooding where early warning insufficient (non-absorbent where compatible with traditional construction).
- 4. Specification of services to enable function of drainage and reduction of flood waters (water and waste pumps).

3.6 SENSITIVITIES

The nature of use within a public park is potentially controversial, particular in the context of Pollok Country Park, which has seen significant historic public protest against the M77 motorway and latterly the 'Go-Ape' proposals. Fears over the potential loss of public amenity space, disruption of established use of the park and perceived commercialisation of a public asset are significant issues which can provoke public protest – even if not proposed. A careful balance of public access and public benefit against the need to generate sufficient funds to maintain a public asset will need to be effectively communicated from the outset. The core message of retained ownership by GCC with a charitable organisation as lessee, potentially receiving commercial rents from sub-tenants for the benefit of maintaining the complex, will need to be emphasised throughout the project development.

3.7 USE

The over-riding restrictions on use are contextual under the primary restriction of the Conservation Agreement and the provision that the former estate is maintained for the benefit of the citizens of Glasgow. In a planning sense, the situation is interesting as there have been established uses such as power station, sawmill, laundry, offices, residential accommodation, visitor attraction, garages and doocot on the site. It is anticipated that the principal of uses discussed will be supported, subject to the details of access, servicing etc.

The 2016 Options Appraisal considered a variety of uses and concluded the preferred solution was a mixed use solution which encourages a high volume of public access and engagement, carefully balanced with a number of income generating uses such as a café, shop accommodation to let and some commercial units – this option would retain a livestock attraction, public toilets and a refreshed visitor centre whilst maximising opportunities to develop skills, training and education linked to Pollok Estate's many assets including the walled garden, animals and woodland.

4. OPTIONS FOR USE

The 2017 activities have sought to explore and refine the options for use through public consultation, development of an outline conservation plan and study of the business and governance models.

4.1 SUMMARY OF PUBLIC ENGAGEMENT

Co-ordinated by Northlight Heritage, the public engagement ran over seven events, with six events covering three themes (past, present and future) twice and culminating in a final sharing event in December. The seven themes explored in the Pollok Futures and sharing event emerged through the consultation process. The themes of: growing; learning; playing; making; living; working; eating and drinking were developed from the feedback from attendees at the 'Pollok Past' and 'Unstable Present' events as well as responses to the questionnaires.

The engagement process confirmed that participants appreciate Pollok Stables for their conservation value as well as their amenity values. The relevance of the complex as the centre of a former working agricultural estate and design landscape in the urban context was well understood. This is evidenced in the suggestions that are linked to the former estate's previous uses and management, including traditional crafts and food production as well as learning and recreation.

The feedback and summary session held in December 2017 envisioned a mix of activities that encourage engagement with and learning about the conservation values of the site whilst generating income to ensure long-term viability.

It was apparent that there was a particular desire from the public for the retention of the function of stabling for the heavy horses. This is no doubt borne out of the fact that this is currently the only 'attraction' in the stables complex and deemed to be fundamental to the character of the place, currently. Whether this desire is specifically about the retention of horse stabling within the complex or whether it is about having a dedicated location where the public are guaranteed to be able to interact with the horses (or indeed any livestock) up close is worth further interrogation – but it can be assumed that there is a strong public desire for Pollok Stables to retain its function as an agricultural base for livestock.

Stables	Providing stabling and tack room for the Pollok Clydesdales
Base for operational staff	Providing a base and facilities for operational staff with duties which interact with the public (gardens, livestock etc)
Visitor Centre	Providing information and interpretation highlighting the park's history as a medieval estate, working farm and designed landscape, with active learning linked to livestock, trees, archaeology, architecture, etc. To include accessible toilets.
Cafe	Informal and small with large outdoor space, offering light meals, coffees, snacks – using produce from gardens where possible. Income

The public consultation also expressed a desire for the following uses:

	generated could subsidise cookery training as part of social enterprise.
Training Kitchen	Providing training for young people to enhance skills and employability and offering cookery classes to general public.
Studio Spaces	Working spaces for artists and crafts people, particularly ones whose work is linked to the natural / cultural heritage of the area.
Workshop spaces	Artists and makers offering workshops in traditional crafts such as woodwork, pottery and weaving.
Arts and Crafts shop	Showcasing and offering for sale the work of local artists and craftspeople, especially products made at the stables.
Farm Shop	Offering produce from the garden for sale, including vegetables, fruits and plants.
Farm School	Offering urban school children an intense learning experience about agricultural work, food production and relationship with land through day visits, workshops and residential stays.
Holiday cottage(s)	Offering unique experience for those wanting to stay in an A listed building on a beautiful estate.
Event space	Offering spaces and support for corporate, community and private events.

These uses will be interrogated further as part of the outline business case, and incorporated into the design brief for the physical alterations.

It should be noted that these uses were developed as a result of the public consultation and in no way prejudice the rights of Glasgow City Council to determine their own operational requirements in terms of the management and maintenance of Pollok Country Park. Similarly, some of these uses would come into conflict or competition with services or activities which will be provided or delivered either at Pollok House or the completed Burrell Collection.

4.2 SUMMARY OF CONSERVATION NARRATIVE

In the Conservation Narrative developed by conservation accredited architect Fiona Sinclair, Pollok Stables is described as an architectural biography, telling the tale of the estate to a greater extent than any of the other built features within Pollok Country Park. Ranking alongside Provands Lordship and Provan Hall in historic importance to Glasgow, Pollok Stables encompasses centuries of use and disuse, demonstrating its potential to happily accommodate change as the site evolves to remain relevant in a changing context of very many years.

The Conservation Narrative strongly recommends the need for extensive archaeological investigation within the courtyard of the Stables, around the remains of the Laighe Castle and along the lengths and returns of the West façade, with a full Standing Building Survey deemed to be essential.

The Conservation Statement assesses levels of significance such as: Outstanding or Exceptional; Considerable; Moderate; Neutral and; Negative or Intrusive. In the case of Pollok Stables and based on what is currently known about the site, the

Conservation Narrative schedules the following particular aspects to be of Outstanding Significance:

- The outer and inner elevations of the West range, with the gateway considered to be exceptional.
- The inner face of the North range
- The outer face of the North West corner
- The north east corner, where it is believed the remains of the Laighe Castle survive
- The outer face of the South range where an early cottage may have been incorporated into the present building

Whilst there are also numerous aspects that are deemed to be of Considerable, Moderate and Neutral significance, there are aspects deemed to be of negative significance which reflect that Pollok Stables have been poorly managed, in architectural conservation terms, for a significant period of time. These elements of negative significance include:

- Absence of finial (or weather-vane) to the cupola
- Clumsy soil and rainwater goods to the outer elevation of the West range
- The window inserted into the blind niche on the courtyard facing pediment of the West range
- The window created out of a doorway in the north wall of the pend
- The doorway inserted at the base of an early infill north of the gateway on the inner face of the west range.
- The truncated chimney on the outer south west corner
- The wheelchair ramp at the south of the east range
- The built-up buttressed section of the riverside wall with poor stone coursing
- Tired signage, alarm boxes, TV aerials, surface run wiring, spikes, chimney mounted cameras, cycle racks and floodlights
- Internal services generally
- Roughcast finish on the sawmill walls
- Steel doors and roller shutters
- The decorative scheme
- The concrete roof to the north east store
- Felted roof over the former heating chamber east of the east range
- Field gates generally
- Underground drainage, known to be in poor condition, use of granite setts in the courtyard, monobloc and tarmac
- The oil tank and bund behind the laundry
- Missing roof ventilators to the sawmill and laundry
- Cast-iron rainwater goods on the face of the Laighe Castle wall
- The steps and handrails to the first floor entrance on the north-east corner
- Panel of render on the outer wall of the south range
- Cement pointing

The Conservation Narrative notes that the underlying conservation approach to all works should carefully protect elements of Outstanding and Considerable significance and remove elements of Negative significance. However, it is also worth noting that if economic, social and cultural benefits can be demonstrated, the case for sensitive alterations to elements of Moderate or Neutral significance can be made. This indicates that the southerly end of the East range and the former Laundry offer the best opportunities for light-touch intervention, but that the outstanding nature of the entire group must be retained.

By way of a summary, the Conservation Narrative concludes that it is rare for a complex of buildings to provide such an extensive historic and social commentary over such a long period of time. The public engagement confirmed strong support for the conservation values and character of the Pollok Stables complex and offers range of uses that are compatible with the desire to create a vibrant hub for the Park. Pollok Stables captures the story of the estate and it is at Pollok Stables where that story should be further explored.

4.3 SUMMARY OF BUSINESS CASE

Co-ordinated by Community Enterprise, the outline business case was developed in conjunction with considerations towards appropriate governance models for the site and in alignment with ongoing public engagement.

Desktop research was undertaken to understand the visitor numbers to Pollok Country Park, reasons for their visit, duration, factors in deciding to visit the park and level of interest in park developments. This informed a better understanding of the profile of existing visitors to Pollok Country Park.

Market Analysis and research was undertaken for each of the anticipated use themes: eating and drinking; office space; studio space; conference and events space and; accommodation.

Preliminary research was undertaken on case studies with similar characteristics. These included: Restoration Yard, Dalkeith; Dumfries House, Auchinleck; Mugdock Stables, Milngavie; Tatton Park, Knutsford and; House for an Art Lover, Glasgow.

Discussions were held with stakeholders (GCC, NTS, Glasgow Life) which highlighted key issues:

- Consensus of dismay at present condition of the Stables
- The stables needed vibrant mixed usage, relevant to local communities
- Strengthen connection with Pollok House and for the wider Country Park to be managed more effectively as a single entity, rather than a series of separate attractions
- Uncertainty amongst GCC staff about long term location and base for activities

Regarding the scheduled proposed uses, it was noted that:

- Future uses should complement, not compete with, Pollok House and the Burrell Collection
- Café: the Burrell Collection were relaxed about additional catering offerings at the Stables, but NTS were more concerned due to proximity of competition. This was a popular suggestion from the public.
- Event spaces would be provided by the Burrell and Pollok House and feedback from community groups suggested this might be too far for evening meetings for community groups (particularly in winter).
- There was little or no demand for accommodation in support of weddings at Pollok House.
- More public toilets are needed within the park
- Need a holistic solution for vehicles in the park provision of land train and peripheral car parking.
- Concerns about capacity of community groups emerging 'Friends of Pollok Country Park' group are an amenity group, not a Community Development Trust.

Discussions with potential tenants were held, to understand the typical issues that might arise from differing uses. Some such uses had the potential for significant rental income, some aligned very closely with the various uses suggested and others presented innovative and ambitious suggestions. These discussions included:

- Woodland Kindergarten
- Galgael
- Scottish Furniture Makers Association
- Wasps
- Kinship Care
- Whisky industry representative

The discussions and research carried out helped inform the short-listing of potential uses – depending on the anticipated governance structure. It was considered that the development of office space would not be pursued as there was weak demand and that it was too isolated. Holiday accommodation was considered to have little demand and again would not be appropriate given the isolation of the site.

Whilst exciting and innovative, the potential for a micro-brewery or distillery would require significant reliance on private capital investment and may be a controversial use of public space. However, for the complex to be economically sustainable then private investment could be managed on the basis that a commercial rent was paid towards the maintenance of the wider complex. It would be presumed that such a use would only be part of a range of offerings and complement a variety of uses on the site.

The remaining uses had their merits and further refinement would be dependent on the anticipated governance model.

4.4 SUMMARY OF GOVERNANCE OPTIONS

Perhaps more important than the proposed balance and mix of uses, is how Pollok Stables would be managed. Clearly, Glasgow City Council has been unable to meet its obligations to keep this historic building in good condition. It is recognised that Glasgow City Council owns the complex and that this will not change, but it is also recognised that Glasgow City Council does not have the financial resources to redevelop the site. External investment will be required.

Heritage funding from organisations such as Heritage Lottery Fund, Historic Environment Scotland and the Architectural Heritage Fund all require that there is a public benefit and that there is a fundamental change effected that will ensure the long term viability of the completed project. It is considered that funders would be unlikely to provide support to repair and redevelop the buildings, only for Glasgow City Council to operate the complex in the same way. Consideration needs to be given to how, under GCC ownership, the complex can be effectively managed with a diverse range of uses and be properly maintained to a standard that befits the outstanding significance of this heritage asset.

The proposed model under consideration is that Glasgow City Council offers a long lease for the entirety of the complex to a not-for-profit or charitable organisation who will be responsible for the management and maintenance of the building, as well as developing a range of activities that are of the public benefit. Underneath that main lease, there would potentially be a series of sub-leases to different organisations for different areas of the complex. This would enable a diverse range of uses to take

place as part of a curated offering within a well maintained complex of historic buildings.

Community Enterprise considered that there were three options for the role of lessee for the complex: National Trust for Scotland; Kinship Care; a Community Development Trust. We have also included a narrative on a fall-back solution with Glasgow Life and an independent charitable trust.

4.4.1 National Trust for Scotland

The recommended strategy would be for the National Trust for Scotland to take on the lease for Pollok Stables alongside their lease of Pollok House (albeit with full responsibility for the management and maintenance of the stable complex). NTS are an established not-for-profit with experience in managing historic properties and visitor attractions. Not only could this help reconnect Pollok House with the stables, it could strengthen NTS presence in what was their spiritual home and simplify a fragmented governance structure within Pollok Country Park. This could also remove the perception of competition with activities at Pollok House as once again the Stables complex could support the function of Pollok House. The perceived lack of community involvement and social impact could be easily mitigated in the activities delivered from the site and in conjunction with the activities at Pollok House – with NTS being well-placed to deliver heritage themed interpretation and activities.

4.4.2 Kinship Care Organisation

This option emerged as a suggestion in furtherance of a 'Dumfries House model' where the stables would be converted into a range of workshops and bunkhouses to support education programmes and apprenticeships for vulnerable young people. Kinship Care is an unincorporated organisation under the umbrella of the Trades House of Glasgow, who expressed an interest in running Pollok Stables as an educational resource centre. This option would require a lot of space within the building and would reduce the level of public access available. It was not clear that this option would be financially viable as GCC Education did not have a budget to support this and thought it unlikely that individual schools would either. Further development of the Kinship Care model would be required before this could be considered further.

4.4.3 Community Development Trust

A community led development group could deliver the project, operate the facility and seek to provide a range of activities to balance the need for public access and income generation in accordance with community will. However, this would be an intensive process of building the capacity of a community group for both the operational requirements. There are examples where local community groups can get organised to deliver major capital projects and also manage heritage assets. This would be an ideal scenario from a community based skills development point of view and would open up different avenues of funding which are more community focused, such as the Big Lottery Fund. However, it is considered that this option is also a high risk as it would require extensive capacity building on an ongoing basis, could potentially lead to the most competition or conflict with both Pollok House and the Burrell Collection and be vulnerable to over-reliance on the income generated by tenants.

4.4.4 Glasgow Life

It is worth considering and alternative scenario whereby Glasgow Life as an ALEO of Glasgow City Council, might take the role of lessee. It is anticipated that whilst Glasgow Life have expressed no current interest in doing so, they would likely be called upon by GCC in the event that no other organisation was found. Similar to

NTS, the established practices, capacity and governance of Glasgow Life would give confidence in their ability to manage the facility, but that it would strengthen the connection with the completed Burrell Collection.

4.4.5 Independent Charitable Trust

Further consideration of an independent charitable trust taking the role of lessee, similar to the 'House for an Art Lover' has not been specifically described as the same challenges present in a community development trust would apply, but with more experienced trustees for each relevant stage of the project and potentially less geographically based funding available. Introducing another party into the governance of Pollok Stables is not encouraged.

Our recommendation therefore is that in the assumed governance model of a long lease being offered by Glasgow City Council, the National Trust for Scotland would be the recommended lessee with overall responsibility for the management and maintenance of a completed stables complex, with a range of sub-tenants providing a variety of uses within the complex.

Use	Ownership would be retained by Glasgow City Council. A long lease could be provided to a charitable developer (such as GBPT) to undertake the capital works. At practical completion, the lease could be assigned on to the National Trust for Scotland (NTS) or similar established heritage charity. The completed complex could be used in conjunction with Pollok House, with provision of gift shop retail and informal catering options provided within the stables complex, alongside the provision of heritage interpretation for the entirety of the former estate, with programme of events and activities linked to the main house. Additional space, such as the sawmill, hen house and laundry could be offered for sub-let to other organisations underneath the facility management of NTS.
Works necessary	Necessary works include stabilisation of existing structure by underpinning the south and west ranges. Renewal of site drainage. Decayed timbers to be replaced to roof and intermediate floors, renewal of roof finishes (new slates to match salvaged slates), localised stone repairs where required and internal fit-out to basic standards where appropriate. Further works will be required for bespoke fit-out to determine uses as scheduled by NTS and sub-tenants.
Cost	Indicative costs of the capital works to the Courtyard are £5.2m with an additional £1.3m for the works to sawmill, laundry and hen-house. Total works costs £6.5m, total project costs £8.5m. These works comprise sensitive repair with only minimal alteration and intervention, in line with conservation narrative and design proposals. Interventions and alterations are predominantly internal, with only a basic fitout.
Pros and Cons	 ADVANTAGES: NTS has strong track-record in managing historic assets NTS has good organisational capacity to undertake responsibility for the site Provides confidence in capacity to deliver core functions of café, gift shop, visitor centre whilst also provides flexibility of enabling

4.5 RECOMMENDED OPTION

third parties to rent space (horse stabling, artist studios, nursery, sawmill, furniture workshop)
Potential for surplus to subsidise maintenance of Pollok House
 Economy of staffing over two adjacent sites
 Re-establishing the relationship between House and Stables
Reduced conflict / competition with other attractions in park
 Consolidating the number of stakeholders within park
DISADVANTAGES
• Proposals to be developed alongside proposals for Pollok House
 Complicated negotiations required before two large organisations
(GCC and NTS) could reach agreement to this arrangement.
Legal discussions in association with renewal of lease of Pollok
House may be protracted
Less direct community involvement

4.6 COSTS

The Design Team have scheduled works costs based on March 2018 costs. These costs exclude VAT.

Item		Allowance
Stables Courtyard Construction Costs	£	3,597,473
Preliminaries	£	546,000
Works contingencies (15%)	£	621,521
Inflation	£	405,024
Outbuildings	£	1,324,785
Estimated Construction Costs	£	6,494,803
Other Capital Work (parking, landscaping & lighting)	£	200,000
Fittings, Fixtures and Equipment	£	225,000
Design Team Fees (9%)	£	614,413
Project Coordinator/Management (2.5%)	£	170,670
Surveys	£	35,000
Plans/Reports	£	35,000
Statutory Permissions	£	15,000
Legal Fees	£	45,000
Insurance	£	50,000
Activities/Interpretation	£	250,000
New Posts	£	150,000
Publicity & Marketing	£	6,000
Consultation	£	5,000
Evaluation	£	20,000
Project Contingency (10%)	£	200,000
TOTAL ESTIMATED PROJECT COST	£	8,477,705

4.7 FUNDING

With costs indicated in the region of £8.5m, it is not inconceivable that once GCC has decided on its strategy and once the project has developed, inflation could take the costs to a total of £10m.

External funders will expect a contribution from the local authority / building owner and Glasgow City Council should expect this commitment to be in the region of $\pounds 2.5m$ and committed at the outset to enable it to be used to lever other funds.

Historic Environment Scotland offer Building Repair Grants of up to £500k towards eligible repair costs and it is assumed that this Category A Listed building would meet their requirements for funding, which can be used to help lever other match funding.

The Heritage Lottery Fund are already heavily invested in Pollok Country Park through their support for the Burrell Renaissance project. HLF will be particularly keen to see their investment protected with a complimentary project at Pollok Stables. On costs of £10m, HLF could be approached for up to £5m – but in the context of a competitive funding environment and less lottery funding available, £3m might be more realistic. For the right project though, HLF could fund up to £5m of the costs, if it reflected their aspirations and outcomes.

In the later stages of the project development, the Scottish Government Regeneration Capital Grant Fund could award grants of up to £2m for relevant projects. Whilst not within a deprived urban community, the complex would increase commercial floor space and support local jobs in deprived communities on the periphery of Pollok Country Park. RCGF funding is time-bound and could only be secured when the capital works were imminent.

If the project was delivered by Glasgow Building Preservation Trust then the onward assignation of a long lease would command a significant consideration from the lessee at the point of practical completion – a figure to be determined by a district valuation and anticipated to be between $\pounds 250$ and $\pounds 500k$.

Other funding sources including charitable trusts, foundations, crowdfunding, community shares, private donations etc would all be explored as part of more detailed development of the project. However, cognisance should be given to the recent fundraising of large heritage focused projects in Glasgow which may have 'soaked up' allocations in this sector – such as the Burrell Renaissance project, the Mackintosh Restoration project and the Citizens Theatre.

Funder	Contribution	
Glasgow City Council	£	2,500,000
Historic Environment Scotland		500,000
Heritage Lottery Fund		3,000,000
Scottish Government Regeneration Capital Grant Fund		2,000,000
Other Charitable Trust and Foundations		250,000
Consideration from Lessee		250,000
Total	£	8,500,000

A more detailed funding strategy would be investigated further as part of the project development.

4.8 URGENCY AND THE 'DO NOTHING' RESPONSE

There are two reasons why Glasgow City Council must not continue to ignore its obligations to the Pollok Stables complex.

The reputational damage to GCC resulting from the partial loss of the buildings will be significant. Glasgow City Council owns and is responsible for the management and maintenance of the Category A Listed building. Already in a perilous condition, the decline of this building will only accelerate whilst GCC grapples with the reality that it must undertake emergency capital works to safeguard the building from imminent collapse. The public outcry and reputational damage that will follow from even a partial collapse will cause significant damage to Glasgow City Council in its future attempts to deliver projects seeking support from heritage funders. The time to act and arrest the decline of this Category A Listed building is now.

Furthermore, the longer it takes Glasgow City Council to deliver emergency repairs and commit a contribution to the long term redevelopment project, the more expensive that project will become. The increasing costs associated with the deterioration of the condition of the building will make an already challenging redevelopment project even more difficult to fund. The costs of additional works resulting from the deterioration will be compounded by the inflationary increase in costs resulting from the delay in undertaking the works.

Glasgow City Council must now undertake the capital consolidation works and commit a significant sum of money as a contribution to the long term future of the buildings, if Pollok Stables is to have any hope of survival.

5. CONCLUSION

In developing a vision for the future of Pollok Stables, consideration of a preferred option is mostly focused on governance and management. The nature of uses are broadly similar across the options and the nature of the works is very much the same at this early stage. The main issue is whether an organisation can be identified that can manage and maintain the completed complex, balancing the need for public access against income generation to support the maintenance of the site.

It is essential that Glasgow City Council recognise that in order to lever significant external capital investment, the management and use of the complex must change. Whilst ownership would remain with Glasgow City Council, a long lease on a full repairs and maintenance basis to a charitable third party is the most credible route forward.

It is our recommendation that Glasgow City Council identifies the National Trust for Scotland, where there is an established heritage-led charity with extensive experience in managing historic properties as visitor attractions, as preferred lessee for the completed Pollok Stables complex.

With extensive research of uses and a strong understanding of the public preferences for retention of the historic site, there is a wealth of information to support the preferred options for use and lessee whilst still enabling flexibility as the project evolves.

This recommendation in no way prejudices the considerations of Glasgow City Council, whose agreement will be required before progressing discussions with the National Trust for Scotland to develop the project further.

In the meantime, immediate action is required to fully document and record the complex in existing condition prior to emergency works to consolidate the buildings.

6. ACTION PLAN

To develop the project further, some immediate actions are required of the building owners – namely to ensure the buildings do not deteriorate any further and to seek Glasgow City Council agreement in principal to assign a long lease to a charitable third party to operate, manage and maintain the completed complex.

It is recommended that the buildings remain occupied as much as safely possible. Unoccupied buildings are vulnerable and the retained operational presence of GCC is preferred, where this can be safely facilitated.

It is recommended that Galgael or similar charitable organisation with heritage volunteers, be invited to make meanwhile use of the sawmill buildings, helping to clear out these spaces and investigate the retention of the original sawmill machinery. Activities which continue to attract the attention of park-users, including the retention of livestock and horses within the country park, will help to maintain awareness of the condition of the buildings.

If Glasgow City Council agree in principal to a long lease for charitable third party, then focus moves to how to deliver the project and in particular, the capital intervention required. That third party could ultimately be the National Trust for Scotland (as recommended), Glasgow Life or a bespoke charitable trust yet to be established.

The National Trust for Scotland have advised that they would not be in a position to undertake the capital project delivery themselves – but have reiterated advice previously given to Glasgow City Council that any future funding applications to Heritage Lottery Fund should take into consideration the wider interests – specifically the works programme to Pollok House and connections with the Burrell Collection. It is logical that any funding applications should be undertaken in partnership with proposals for Pollok House. However, this highlights the inter-linked issues which will complicate the negotiations required between GCC and NTS. But, if early discussions between GCC and NTS could agree the role of lessee with full repairs and maintenance obligations in principle, this would be sufficient to enable the Pollok Stables project to be developed further, regardless of negotiations on the Pollok House lease renewal.

There is an assumption that Glasgow Building Preservation Trust would co-ordinate the development of the project. GBPT is well placed to deliver this project, with extensive experience of working with GCC and NTS and a long track record in delivering capital projects to save buildings at risk. GBPT is a small independent charity that can efficiently procure an experienced team to navigate the numerous difficulties of delivering heritage projects and are well positioned to be able to secure external funding for project development and delivery.

GBPT would seek to develop an application to Heritage Lottery Fund over a period of 9-12 months, with a two year development period leading to a two year delivery period (including one year of on-site works).

With potentially 4 years ahead before works could start, it is important that Glasgow City Council arrest the immediate decline of the buildings, as a matter of urgency.

	TASK	LEAD		
	Short term / immediate action			
1	Record existing condition of buildings – with standing building survey and laser scanning.	GCC Property and GCC LES		
2	Undertake works to arrest the decline of the building: adequately prop the elevations, address water ingress and consider partial downtakings only as a last resort.	GCC Property and GCC LES		
3	Seek agreement to develop project with NTS as end-user – at LES Senior management, Councillors, Pollok Advisory Committee and finally City Administration Committee levels.	GCC LES		
	Medium term action			
4	Enable additional meanwhile use of sawmill space (remove debris and repair original sawmill machinery)	GCC – LES Parks Management		
5	Issue vehicular access proposals to stakeholders for discussion in advance of publishing Masterplan	Glasgow Life		
6	Develop project partnership agreement with GCC, NTS and GBPT	GBPT		
7	Secure project development funding to develop Round 1 bid in partnership between NTS, GCC and GBPT including MyPark Scotland campaign.	GBPT		
8	Progress discussions around financial commitment from Glasgow City Council (25 – 50% of total cost).	GBPT		
9	Develop community archaeology project to better understand pre-history of evolution of complex.	GBPT / Northlight		
10	Develop project for HLF Round 1 bid	GBPT		

7. APPENDICES

Appdx	Title	Author
1	Pollok Stables Community Engagement	Northlight Heritage
1a	Engagement Exhibition posters	Northlight Heritage
2	Design Report	Collective Architecture
3	Research Report	Community Enterprise
3a	Business Model Appraisal	Community Enterprise
3b	Outline Business Case	Community Enterprise
4	Selected Photographs	Project Team
restricted	Conservation Narrative	Fiona Sinclair Architect
restricted	Structural Engineer's Report	David Narro Associates
restricted	Construction Cost Estimate	Gardiner and Theobold
restricted	1939 Conservation Agreement	National Trust for Scotland